

Milan, May 28<sup>th</sup>, 2016

**Final Report of Assistant Professor Call**

**Department:** Policy Analysis and Public Management

**Application deadline:** December 31, 2015

**Hiring committee:** Andrea Colli, Ileana Steccolini (replaced Francesco Longo), Arnie Aassve, Paolo Pinotti

**Number of valid applications:** 167

**Number of flyouts:** 6

**Recommended Action:** Call to be closed with 1 position filled.

**Summary:** End of August 2015, the Department posted a call for 1 assistant professor in Sociology, Demography and Political Science (Italian disciplinary sectors 13/D3, 14/A2, 14/C1, 14/C2, 14/D1. The call was advertised on line in the main academic job market websites. No specific job market was attended by the recruiting committee.

We received 167 valid applications. Each application was initially evaluated individually by all the members of the hiring committee to determine a short list of candidates. After a first screening and selection of dossiers submitted by December 31, 2015, six candidates were selected for a flyout at Bocconi between the end of February and the beginning of March, 2016, in order to give a seminar presenting their job market paper (in alphabetical order):

- Nicoletta Balbo

OMISSIS

For each candidate the Committee organized a schedule of meetings with faculty members (on voluntary basis) and asked faculty members to fill out evaluation forms based on the performance of the candidate during the seminar, personal meeting with the candidate or reading of CVs and job market papers. This is now considered to be the standard procedure of the Department.

On March 15<sup>th</sup>, 2016, the Committee held a meeting (Prof. Steccolini, absent, had sent a email stating her position).

The committee agreed on the following procedure. Each member of the committee put forward her/his personal ranking of candidates, based on personal evaluations. The committee also agreed on

taking into consideration the opinion of several relevant "stakeholders" not formally or directly involved in the Committee's decisions, as the Director of the Department, Professor Giovanni Fattore and the Director of the PhD program in Policy Analysis, Professor Ross MacMillan. This was done on an informal basis by some members of the committee.

Last but not least, the Committee decided to put a great emphasis on the opinions expressed by the Department's members in their evaluation documents.

On the basis of these rankings, the Committee agreed on a final one, which the Committee itself considers to be the one which at best fits the opinion of almost all the main stakeholders. The final ranking - limited to two candidates, is the one to be submitted to the Department Executive Committee, such that the latter has all the information to make a decision on the offer.

On the basis of this information the Committee ranked NICOLETTA BALBO first in the candidates' ranking: 94% of the Department's members attending the seminar/filling the form (overall, 17) indicate that the Department should consider her for an offer. In general Balbo's seminar has been highly appreciated by Department's members. The Committee was impressed by the overall appreciation expressed about Balbo's CV and her research achievements. Only one of the anonymous comments received is very critical towards the candidate. While recognizing her research achievements, there are also reservations coming from one member of the Department about her potentially scarce productivity since after having received one prestigious grant she has not put forward any significant result - at least in the area for which she was assigned the grant for. On the other side, several members of the department praise her for having achieved prestigious research results with publications in the major journals of the field. Given this situation, the committee opted for following the opinion of the vast majority of the attendants to the seminar, and of the committee's members as well who unanimously considered Balbo as an outstanding candidate.

OMISSIS

The Committee closed its meeting with an unanimous decision.

Andrea Colli

